

# **PROGRAM REVIEW 2012**

# A COMPOSITE REPORT

**Student Support and Administrative Units** 

The purpose of this report, *Program Review: A Composite Report of Student Support and Administrative Units* (hereinafter referred to as the "Composite Report") is to highlight college wide assessment activities, by way of program review, at the Northern Marianas College for Academic Year 2011-2012.

The Composite Report is authored by the Program Review and Outcomes Assessment Committee (PROAC) for submission to College Council and the President to inform the decision making process with the ultimate goal of improving student learning at the College.

This report covers an overview of the program review process, strengths and areas for improvement, findings and recommendations for action, feedback to the program and institution, structure and process, and recommendations for the next cycle.

# Program Review and Outcomes Assessment Committee (PROAC)

PROAC was created on July 13, 2007 with committee members appointed by the President from a cross-section of the campus community.

PROAC Mission Statement

Build and sustain a campus-wide culture of evidence, which promotes, fosters and improves student learning outcomes at the course, program and institutional levels.

| Committee Members                                                |                                                                               |  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Name                                                             | REPRESENTING                                                                  |  |
| Jacqueline Che                                                   | Director, Office of Institutional Effectiveness (PROAC Chair)                 |  |
| Barbara Merfalen                                                 | Dean, Academic Programs & Services                                            |  |
| Leo Pangelinan                                                   | Dean, Student Services                                                        |  |
| David Attao                                                      | Dean, Administration & Resource Development                                   |  |
| Tracy Guerrero                                                   | Chief Financial Officer                                                       |  |
| Amanda Allen                                                     | Director, Distance Learning Education; ALO                                    |  |
| Jonathan Liwag                                                   | Director, Information Technology                                              |  |
| Daniel Kintol                                                    | Vice President, Staff Senate                                                  |  |
| Richard Waldo                                                    | Faculty Representative                                                        |  |
| Charlotte Cepeda                                                 | Faculty Representative                                                        |  |
| Jennifer Maratita                                                | Faculty Representative                                                        |  |
| Roland Merrar                                                    | Faculty Representative, School of Education                                   |  |
| Rose Lazaro                                                      | Program Coordinator, Tinian Instructional Site                                |  |
| Vacant                                                           | Rota Instructional Site                                                       |  |
| Vacant                                                           | Academic Council                                                              |  |
| Chenglong "Alex" Shen                                            | Student Representative, ASNMC                                                 |  |
| Former- or Alternate- Members, Contributors and Supporting Staff |                                                                               |  |
| Galvin Deleon Guerrero                                           | Former Director, Office of Institutional Effectiveness (PROAC Chair)          |  |
| Roy Greenland                                                    | Former "Acting" Director, Office of Institutional Effectiveness (PROAC Chair) |  |

| Committee Members                                                                      |                                                                 |  |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Name REPRESENTING                                                                      |                                                                 |  |
| Cyndi Deleon Guerrero Former Vice President, Faculty Senate                            |                                                                 |  |
| Kyle Podziewski Former Faculty Representative, School of Education                     |                                                                 |  |
| Orrin Pharmin  Program Coordinator, Area Health Education Center, for Da Attao         |                                                                 |  |
| Maria Aguon Instructor/Program Coordinator, Tinian Instructional Site, for Rose Lazaro |                                                                 |  |
| Lisa Hacskaylo                                                                         | Institutional Researcher, Office of Institutional Effectiveness |  |

# **Table of Contents**

| I.   | Process Overview                                  | 5  |
|------|---------------------------------------------------|----|
| II.  | Strengths and Areas for Improvement               | 7  |
| III. | Findings and Recommendations                      | 9  |
|      | GROUP C: Student Support and Administrative Units | 12 |
| VII. | References                                        | 22 |

### I. Process Overview

As a first step in the direction of institutionalizing self-reflective dialogue, PROAC developed the NMC Assessment Taxonomy to more clearly identify the various academic programs, both degree and certificate, as well as student and administrative services the institution provides. The taxonomy is divided into four groups: Group A (General Education, Bachelor and Associate Degree Programs), Group B (Certificate Programs), Group C (Student Services and Administrative Units), and Group D (Special Programs and Services).

NMC uses Nichols and Nichols' "Five-Column Model" for reporting Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) and Administrative Unit Outcomes (AUO's). This five-column model essentially provides the substantive framework that all programs, departments, and units must use in designing their assessment plans and reports. The complete Five-Column Model is also identified as Form 1.

For the Five-Column Model for SLOs, Column 1 identifies the College mission as the driving force behind all assessment activities. Column 2 includes program learning outcomes (about 3 to 5) which indicate what students will be able to know, do, think or value as a result of a given educational experience. Column 3 provides specific assessment tools that will measure what is to be achieved as identified in the previous column, as well as criteria for success. Column 4 summarizes assessment findings, as linked to the set program learning outcomes, while Column 5 discusses implications of the data (either quantitative or qualitative) in terms of how they can be used to improve certain aspects of the program.

For the Five -Column Model for AUOs, the same information is contained in the columns, as discussed above. The primary difference, however, occurs in Column 2 where a variation of the question may be asked, "What will the unit or department provide, improve or increase to improve student learning or services?" or "What will the students or clients be satisfied with, receive, understand or do?" What is important to remember is that SLO assessment results in improved *learning*, while AUO assessment results in improved *service*.

To assist programs in completing the Five-Column Model, a system of memos detailing the sequence and scope of each step of the model was put in place. All the identified academic and student services programs were scheduled to submit the first three columns completed in "Memo 1" on December 31, 2011. PROAC reviewed Memo 1 submissions for improvement through a process of dialogue with the various programs. Dyads, PROAC members assigned to work closely with programs for which they took primary reading and feedback responsibilities, took the lead in reviews and feedback to programs. With the first three columns having been completed with Memo 1, each program was then required to submit Memo 2 (completed 5-column Form 1), which reports on the fourth and fifth columns, by July 31, 2012.

The completion of Form 1 was planned on a College-defined two-year assessment cycle, with specified deadlines for submission of assessment requirements (See NMC's *Two-Year Assessment Cycle Schedule: Program Level Assessment*). It was hoped that this

cycle would gradually regularize and routinize all assessment activities on campus since every grouping in the assessment taxonomy had a document submission requirement every semester. A *Compliance Monitoring Matrix* was developed and maintained by PROAC, with administrative support from the Office of Institutional Effectiveness staff.

PROAC met over several months to review the reports submitted in September 2012. Dyads took the lead in the review of their respective programs, although each PROAC member read and participated in the discussions. Decisions were made by the group and not by the dyads. Dyads documented strengths, weaknesses, general comments, and PROAC decisions on the recommendations to programs and to the institution. The results of the extensive reviews are presented in the PROAC Composite Report, 2012.

The due dates of the fifth cycle Memos and Forms are the following:

1. Memo 1: December 31, 2011

2. Form 1: July 31, 2012

3. Form 2: September 30, 2012

Only Student Support and Administrative Units (Group C) were required to submit a Form 2. All other programs submitted a Form 1 during this cycle. See *Table 2: Compliance Matrix* for information on groups' Form 2 submission compliance.

Dyads met during the months of October 2012 to August 2013 and dialogued about the strengths and weaknesses of submitted Form 2s. PROAC scheduled weekly meetings to discuss submitted Form 2s and discuss findings made by group dyads.

At the end of the review process, PROAC concluded the need for continuous improvement in the next cycle and the need for OIE and PROAC to increase communications with all programs and provide assistance to authors of program review submissions.

**Table 1: Compliance Matrix (5<sup>th</sup> Cycle)** 

| FORM 1                        | GROUPS                                                |                   |  |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|--|
| Compliance as of October 2012 | Non-Academic Student Support and Administrative Units | Academic Programs |  |
| Yes - submitted               | 11                                                    | 9                 |  |
| Incomplete                    | 14                                                    | 0                 |  |
| No - yet to submit            | 0                                                     | 14                |  |
| Total                         | 25                                                    | 23                |  |

**Table 2: Compliance Matrix** 

| FORM 2 | GROUPS |
|--------|--------|

| Compliance as of November | Non-Academic Student Support and | Academic Programs |
|---------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------------|
| 2012                      | Administrative Units             |                   |
| Yes - submitted           | 20                               |                   |
| Incomplete                | 5                                |                   |
| No - yet to submit        | 0                                |                   |
| Total                     | 25                               |                   |

### II. Strengths and Areas for Improvement

### Strengths:

- 1. Out of 25 Non-Academic Student Support and Administrative programs required to submit Form 2s, 20 programs, or 80 percent, submitted complete Form 2s in Cycle 5 2012.
- 2. The Form 2 template was revised to include more substantial data, evidence, and analysis and required programs to link recommendations directly to data, evidence, and analysis included in the Form 2.
- 3. The schedule allowed for dialogue between PROAC members and Form 2 authors to work on drafts before final submissions, which improved the quality of submissions.
- 4. PROAC revised the rubrics to improve and assess the merit of each Form 2 submission.
- 5. With more data and evidence collected, shared, and consolidated, more programs are making the shift to data-driven decision-making to achieve prescribed outcomes
- 6. As a result of the program review process, more information, data, and evidence is being shared between programs and being consolidated, reinforcing the growing culture of evidence at the college.
- 7. Many program review submissions indicate that programs have begun to dialogue more with other programs, which has enhanced collaboration and cooperation within the college and reinforced the participatory governance model of the college.

### Weaknesses and areas for improvement:

1. Out of 48 programs required to submit Form 1s, 20 programs, or 42 percent, submitted complete Form 1s in Cycle 5 2012.

- 2. The work of reviewing and evaluating Form 2s was not evenly assigned to PROAC members working in pairs, given the high turn-over and loss of continuity of PROAC members.
- 3. A three month gap followed after the former PROAC Chair resigned. Due to the extension given to programs for Form 2 submissions, PROAC members were crunched for time in reading and evaluating Form 2 submission with no Chair overseeing PROAC. This rushed process may account for many of the above weaknesses.
- 4. Work was difficult to complete during the summer while faculty were away, accreditation activities, and resignation of former PROAC Chair.
- 5. Attendance in PROAC meetings declined from December 2011 through January 2012 and from December 2012 through June 2013.
- 6. Stemming from time crunch and pressures of reaffirming accreditation and meeting deadlines, the efforts of OIE to promote program review through training and logistical support have been limited by additional duties and responsibilities that have been undertaken by the office.
- 7. The leadership, membership, and procedures of PROAC have changed during Cycle 5, making it difficult for this body to build on each successive program review cycle and fulfill its role in assessment and program review.
- 8. Some programs struggled to adequately analyze data and evidence in their program review narratives. Data and evidence were often incomplete and sporadic, and very few programs effectively used data and evidence to justify their recommendations.
- 9. Many programs rely on surveys that measure the satisfaction of clients and participants, but very few programs employ proficiency and competency assessments to gauge if clients understand program processes or procedures, or how much participants learned from the program.
- 10. With many program review protocol sheets that were blank and unsigned, it appears that many programs did not effectively engage program personnel in the program review process.
- 11. Taken together, the above weaknesses strongly suggest that many in the college neither understand nor appreciate the program review process. There appears to be an overall lack of "buy-in" into the program review process.
- 12. While reviewing program review submissions, it became clear that there was a lack of follow-up on institutional recommendations from the previous cycle of program review. This failure to address recommendations from the previous cycle may have, to some degree, undermined the credibility, integrity, and value of the program review process.

### III. Findings and Recommendations

It should be noted that many common findings from this cycle of program review echo common findings from the previous cycle. Recommendations and common findings from both cycles of program review are as follow:

Recommendations to the President, programs, and PROAC:

#### To the President:

- 1. The College needs to continue to aggressively address the staffing needs of its programs. In addition to critical but hard-to-fill positions, such as the Academic Librarian and Director of Information Technology, many programs articulated the need to hire administrative managers in order to ease the administrative burdens placed on faculty and program managers.
- 2. OIE lacks the administrative support needed to sustain program review efforts. There is a need to hire an Assessment Coordinator/Specialist.
- 3. Programs continue to draw attention to inadequate, damaged, and unsafe facilities. While many programs have done what they can to address health and safety hazards as well as become ADA compliant, these programs continue to appeal to the College to repair dilapidated facilities and to provide more space for classrooms, offices, laboratories, learning centers, and storage.

### > To the Programs:

- 1. Provide qualitative and quantitative data to support budget considerations.
- 2. Elaborate on clear links to program effectiveness, and include indirect and direct evidence and data to support program effectiveness.
- 3. Enhance and expand analysis of data and evidence with a focus on what the data and evidence say about respective programs and whether or not those programs are achieving their stated objectives. The data and evidence should be woven into a narrative that tells that story and recommends steps for improvement.
- 4. Use varied assessment tools to enhance data and evidence collection. In particular for professional development, programs should employ proficiency/competency assessments, in addition to participant evaluations.
- 5. Programs that have SLOs should address and provide direct and indirect evidence of student learning.
- 6. All AUOs and PLOs should be mapped to show alignment with the College's general education outcomes.

#### ➤ To PROAC:

- To address high turn-over of members assigned to PROAC, it was recommended that PROAC establish long-term appointments (staggered terms). It was also recommended that members receive compensation for time committed to program review work.
- 2. PROAC members, with the support of OIE, need to better assess each program's grasp of the program review process, and provide individualized assistance to programs that need the most guidance in the next cycle.
- 3. Need to revisit the mechanism for regular follow-up that will enable PROAC to evaluate progress resulting from recommended actions and monitor implementation of recommendations. PROAC should be responsible for following up on institutional recommendations in the next cycle of program review.
- 4. PROAC should develop and distribute a visual aid or a flowchart that summarizes the program review process (i.e. Program Review Handbook). In addition, there is a need to bring the College's program review process into better alignment with the WASC resource guide for "Good Practices" in program review.
- 5. Assure that the relevant Deans and Directors are involved in follow-up actions as a result of the Composite Report.
- 6. Maintain a program review process that is ongoing and reflective. Refine and simplify program review process and forms to ensure better understanding of and buy-in to the process.

In addition to the aforementioned recommendations, the following common findings emerged from this cycle of program review:

- The College should maintain current and accurate community—needs and workforce—demand assessments for its programs. Many programs articulated a need for assistance in gathering data and evidence from programs and departments within the college, as well as agencies and departments outside of the college, in order to better measure the market demand for their respective programs.
- 2. Need to address lack of accountability for member participation in meetings and workload.
- 3. Members disillusioned or display of apathy for the work.

# **PROAC Advisory**

The following advisory by the Program Review and Outcomes Assessment Committee (PROAC) shall apply to all recommendations and feedback, both at the Program and Institutional level.

- 1. All changes to, and creations of, programs and courses should be addressed through the Academic Council, and in compliance with Board policies and procedures and WASC requirements.
- 2. All of the recommendations related to facilities and technology should be addressed in the context of the overall facilities and technology needs of the College.
- 3. All of the recommendations related to the hiring of personnel should be addressed.



# **GROUP C: Student Support and Administrative Units**

| Admissions and Records                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| PRO                                                        | PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                                                            | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                            | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| <ol> <li>2.</li> <li>3.</li> </ol>                         | Begin articulating a transition plan to ensure smooth transition of services and work processes with the implementation of the PowerCAMPUS Self-Service module and online, web-based access to the system.  Continue to pursue recommendation to provide adequate Registration Refresher Training for all registration data entry personnel to ensure consistency and accuracy of registration process and procedures.  Establish and justify an additional full-time Admissions and Records Specialist position to accommodate possible increase in number of transfer students (WICHE), allow for | <ol> <li>1.</li> <li>2.</li> <li>3.</li> <li>4.</li> </ol> | Create a Database Manager position to support OAR. Implement the Self-Service Module and other components to the PowerCAMPUS SIMS. Support OAR and IT staff professional development and PowerCAMPUS training. Purchase a document imaging file management system to archive hard-copy institutional files |
|                                                            | increased capacity and provide office support, and to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                                                            | increase customer service.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| PRO                                                        | OAC feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                                                            | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                            | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| <ol> <li>1.</li> <li>2.</li> <li>3.</li> <li>4.</li> </ol> | Lead and support institutional recruitment efforts. Continue to increase student satisfaction with overall registration process. Refer back to prior surveys and generate corrective action plans to redress matters needing attention. Correct inaccuracies of student information in the database. Ensure accuracy and efficiency of course, grade, degree plans, and graduation data. Update data when errors are noticed. As months and years go by without review and update, database gets muddled.                                                                                           | 1.                                                         | Implement online registration.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

| Auxiliary Services (Bookstore)                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|--|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
| Program                                                                                                                                                         | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |  |
| <ol> <li>Improve Bookstore Survey response rate.</li> <li>Consider options for students to rent and purchase</li> </ol>                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
| hard-copy or e-books.                                                                                                                                           | No recommendations to report for this cycle.                                                                                                                                                                           |  |  |
| <ol> <li>Facilitate getting books from elsewhere or find other<br/>sources to tie into Pell expenses. Make option for<br/>students who could charge.</li> </ol> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
| 4. Coordinate with programs and publishers to ensure that textbooks are received in a timely manner.                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
| 5. Implement self-serve workstations.                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |  |  |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                                                                          | <del>_</del>                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |  |
| Program                                                                                                                                                         | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |  |
| No commentary.                                                                                                                                                  | <ol> <li>More funding to hire an additional Administrative         Assistant and Accountant who can monitor and report financial status.     </li> <li>Need a larger storage room to store books, supplies,</li> </ol> |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                 | and other items such as furniture, obsolete and damaged items.                                                                                                                                                         |  |  |

| Counselin                                                                                       | g Programs and Services                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                                                                                                 | oved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|                                                                                                 | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| train<br>advi:                                                                                  | demic advisement needs to be reviewed. Include<br>sing of advisors; clarify roles and responsibilities,<br>sor accountability, assessment and improvement of<br>sing services.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 1.<br>2.                                                         | Enhance effort to facilitate student transfer to four-<br>year colleges and universities<br>Identify top reasons for student absences and<br>tardiness. Address issues through education and                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 2. Supp 3. Whi explorate Care who espe care array resea must and prov expe univ staff prod impa | sing services. port Start Smart Seminars. le many of the services may be aimed at those in oratory stages such as recent high school graduates, ser Services can also target those in our community request services to explore career options, cially if they have a desire, or need, to make a ser change. The Career Center should provide an yof resources and tools to guide students in arching majors and careers; thus, adequate space t also be allotted to house these career resources reference materials. Additionally, services reded by the Career Center will enable students to be crience a smooth transition to other colleges or ersities. Altogether, having the Career Center and the duce improved educational outcomes and directly act retention, persistence, graduate and transfer as for the College. | <ul><li>3.</li><li>4.</li><li>5.</li><li>6.</li><li>7.</li></ul> | resources as appropriate.  As the College continues to grow, it must address the issue of essential services being available for prospective and currently enrolled students. Sufficient personnel should be available to meet students' needs. The imbalance between enrollment growth and a lack of proportionate staffing level for currently enrolled students are further compounded by the Department's needs to ensure that services are provided on a fair and equitable basis. The hiring of additional counselor would enable the Counseling Department to respond to the demand from enrolled NMC students.  While student enrollment has increased over the past five years, students registered with the Disability Support Services have increased at a higher rate. At the same time, the types of disabilities and the limitations for these students have changed the types of accommodations needed. Consider "universal design" assistive technology (e.g. alternative textbooks, screen magnifiers, readers). Additional funding set aside for Disability Support Services to be utilized to promote a more conducive learning environment for students with disabilities on campus. Impose a non-refundable processing fee for international students obtaining I-20 form which may lead to the issuance of an F-1 visa. |
| DDO AC for all                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| PROAC feedbo                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|                                                                                                 | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 2. The does to ac prov gene 3. Cam                                                              | ride qualitative and quantitative data to support get considerations. absence of more college-level counselor positions on the most standards of providing equitable services ddress student needs. Currently, only one counselor rides academic advising / support counseling to the eral enrolled student population.  apus-wide training for academic tutoring and work individuals with disabilities.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                  | No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |

| Finance Office                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                              |  |  |  |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|--|--|--|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                              |  |  |  |
| Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Institution                                  |  |  |  |
| <ol> <li>Continue to exhibit high quality customer service, communication, and interpersonal skills in your work supporting College programs and students.</li> <li>Establish a schedule or deadline for submission of purchase documents.</li> </ol> | No recommendations to report for this cycle. |  |  |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                              |  |  |  |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                              |  |  |  |
| Program Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                              |  |  |  |
| Remove redundant statements across sections in Form 2 submission. Include Form 1.                                                                                                                                                                     | No commentary.                               |  |  |  |

| Financial Aid Office                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
| Program                                                                                                                 | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
| <ol> <li>Engage staff in Title IV administration and training.</li> </ol>                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
|                                                                                                                         | 1. The institution should comply with all Title IV program rules and regulations (i.e. provide an alcohol and substance abuse program for students and employees, submit its financial audit through USDE's eZ-Audit system no later than June 30 <sup>th</sup> each year pursuant to 34 C.F.R. § 668.23 |  |
|                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |
| Program                                                                                                                 | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |  |
| <ol> <li>Consider measuring improvements at providing award<br/>amounts to meet financial needs of students.</li> </ol> | No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |  |
| <ol><li>Discuss program research/work to acquire/administer<br/>new financial aid programs (i.e. loans).</li></ol>      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |  |

| <b>Human Resources Office</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Continue to work toward streamlining processes to speed the recruitment and hiring process and reduce paperwork (i.e. revisions to NMC's employment application form, a more efficient vacancy announcement process, etc.).                                                    | <ol> <li>Continue to utilize peer data to recommend<br/>adjustments to staffing and salary levels.</li> <li>Develop an integrated Professional Development plan<br/>that addresses the institutional culture and needs, and<br/>incorporate college initiatives and planning processes.</li> </ol> |
| Review and revise the established performance evaluation tools to improve and enhance the performance evaluation process.                                                                                                                                                      | 3. Identify and develop appropriate training for HRO staff to improve understanding and update knowledge and changes in the many complex rules, agreements,                                                                                                                                        |
| 3. Post-interview survey to gather information from the selected candidates on their opinion of the recruitment process. This will allow HRO to gain better insight on how to better serve potential candidates.                                                               | polices and regulations affecting Human Resources operations.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Increase training opportunities focused on needs identified by HRO staff as well as the larger college community, cross train within units, and cross training of staff.                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 5. Orientation for new hires.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| PROJECT III III                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| On the Form 2, complete Section VII on Strategic Planning and Annual Implementation and strengthen Section VIII on Recommendations. These are key sections. Include information on Strategic Planning efforts, particularly with regards to areas concerning customer service. | No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

| Libra | Library Programs & Services                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|-------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| PROAC | approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|       | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
| 2.    | Modify the library survey to extract more information on what subjects or topics students are having difficulty finding information on. The recent library survey showed 32% surveyed were "seldom" able to find what they need.  Look at areas to provide more storage space for LSP. | <ol> <li>Address staffing needs of LSP. Fill the Academic<br/>Librarian vacancy so they can assist with technical<br/>services. Cataloging and library instruction. Fill the<br/>Director position (update: an Academic Librarian<br/>serves in an acting capacity). The Academic Librarian<br/>position is important, as is the hiring of a permanent<br/>Director.</li> </ol> |  |
|       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
| PROAC | feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |  |
|       | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |  |
| 1.    | Review history of the Curriculum Resource Center (CRC), and work with the SOE and Academic Council for resolution about the scope and responsibility for managing the CRC in addition to its respective place in the organizational structure.                                         | No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |  |

| Office of Student Activities & Leadership PROAC approved recommendations for actions to |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
|                                                                                         | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                   |
|                                                                                         | No recommendations to report for this cycle.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | No recommendations to report for this of                                                                                                                                                                                                   | cycle.                            |
| 22010                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |
| PROAC                                                                                   | feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |
|                                                                                         | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                   |
| 2.                                                                                      | Cultivate student leaders. Provide leadership workshops or formal, consistent training for student club leaders and student employees. Work with the Associated Students of Northern Marianas College (ASNMC) to coordinate workshops around leadership, teamwork, etc.  Evaluate current programmatic offerings and brainstorm ideal partnerships, collaborations and possible student activities to offer to students. | <ol> <li>The need for more community service p<br/>Partner with Faculty for students to exp<br/>beyond/incorporated into the classroom<br/>in service activities may result in positiv<br/>academic performance and leadership.</li> </ol> | erience servic<br>. Participatior |
| 3.                                                                                      | Expand the breadth and scope of activities to increase engagement from a broader base of students.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |
| 4.                                                                                      | Consider revising OSAL learning outcomes and create/implement intentional assessment strategies aimed at understanding student learning of these outcomes. As a result, OSAL will be able to articulate student satisfaction, engagement and learning as a result of participation in student activities.                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                   |

| DAC . | approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                           |
|-------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|       | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | Institution                                                                                                               |
|       | Provide longitudinal data (i.e. 5-year trend of test takers and test types).  Recommend program include a financial statement (see CDI's records).  Provide a synopsis of each test and spell out acronyms.  List faculty and staff professional development activities.  List and describe partnerships and agreements (i.e. Collegeboard).  Improve narrative on the growth of program.  Provide a history of program's participation in Program Review.  Program Mapping would be insightful as a number of tests by the program are linked to degree programs.  Publish indirect evidence (i.e. Student Satisfaction Surveys).  Integrate Forms 1 and 2, section IV Data and Evidence Section; proctors and tech support from IT department.  Describe tech support available from partners. | Replace computers in lab. They are beyond their 5 year life cycle and program is administering more computer-based tests. |
| 246   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                           |
| IAC   | feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Institution                                                                                                               |
| 1     | Program  Demonstrate between and agrees sections should be more                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Institution                                                                                                               |
| 1.    | Reporting between and across sections should be more consistent and thorough. Whole sections on the Form 2 were left blank.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | No commentary.                                                                                                            |

| Administrative Services Division                                                                           |                                              |  |  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|--|--|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                              |                                              |  |  |
| Program                                                                                                    | Institution                                  |  |  |
| No recommendations to report for this cycle.                                                               | No recommendations to report for this cycle. |  |  |
| PROAC foodback back to                                                                                     |                                              |  |  |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                     |                                              |  |  |
| Program                                                                                                    | Institution                                  |  |  |
| <ol> <li>Improve articulation of program's history, purpose, and<br/>improvements (milestones).</li> </ol> | No commentary.                               |  |  |
| <ol><li>No Form 1 and lack of program data to demonstrate<br/>program's effectiveness.</li></ol>           |                                              |  |  |

| Tinian Instructional Site |                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|---------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| PROAC                     | PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|                           | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
| 1.                        | Seek other sources of funding to renovate Room E for a state of the art kitchen facility and to relocate Expanded Nutrition Education Program (EFNEP) to the Instructional Site.                                          | As recommended by the IT Director, replace all computers (to include virus protection) in the NMC Tinian Computer Enrichment Center in order to meet the needs of the students and community, and in order |  |
| 2.                        | Provide informational sessions on Academic Programs and Services on a quarterly basis in order to recruit more students to Saipan.                                                                                        | to maximize the use of technology.                                                                                                                                                                         |  |
| 3.                        | Work closely with the Dean of Academics and the Academic Council to identify the shortest route for ere-<br>establishing academic degrees and certificate programs at NMC Tinian (upon full accreditation reaffirmation). |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
| PROAC                     | feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |
|                           | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Institution                                                                                                                                                                                                |  |
| 1.                        | Budget for this possibility (degree and certificate programs from NMC Tinian) as a recommendation from PROAC.                                                                                                             | No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                             |  |
| 2.                        | Conduct a community-needs assessment to determine education and training needs.                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                            |  |

| Exter    | External Relations Office                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                      |  |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| PROAC    | PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                      |  |
|          | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Institution                                                                                          |  |
| 1.<br>2. | Include indirect evidence and data to support program effectiveness (i.e. event surveys).  Utilize survey and evaluation results from major outreach and recruitment events in which ERO helps to coordinate to strengthen program impact on outcomes (i.e. increasing NMC enrollment) | <ol> <li>Maintain current staffing level of three full-time<br/>employees (SY 2011/2012).</li> </ol> |  |
|          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                      |  |
| PROAC    | feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                      |  |
|          | Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Institution                                                                                          |  |
| 1.       | ERO is highly successful in providing a supportive role to a number of entities that engage in recruitment activities.                                                                                                                                                                 | No commentary.                                                                                       |  |
| 2.       | Recommendations for prior-level staffing not supported<br>by workload, number of activated, etc. presented as a<br>comparison between current needs.                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                      |  |
| 3.       | Create agreements with external offices.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                      |  |
| 4.       | Provide documents used as references to set a clarified picture of information presented.                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                      |  |

| Procu | Procurement Property and Management Office               |                        |  |
|-------|----------------------------------------------------------|------------------------|--|
| PROAC | PROAC approved recommendations for actions to            |                        |  |
|       | Program                                                  | Institution            |  |
|       |                                                          | Hire one Specialist I. |  |
|       | No recommendations to report for this cycle.             |                        |  |
|       |                                                          |                        |  |
| PROAC | PROAC feedback back to                                   |                        |  |
|       | Program                                                  | Institution            |  |
| 1.    | On the Form 2, label chart listed on pg. 4, Section I.e. |                        |  |
|       | Overall growth patterns/trends.                          |                        |  |
| 2.    | Section III.c., program mapping – How does PPMO as       | No commentary.         |  |
|       | a department map in correlation? Reflect alignment       |                        |  |
|       | with other programs.                                     |                        |  |
| 3.    | Section V, show organizational chart of where PPMO       |                        |  |
|       | belongs. Also, link vacancy (Procurement Data Entry),    |                        |  |
|       | and refer back to recommendation to hire one Specialist  |                        |  |
|       | I.                                                       |                        |  |

| Community Development Institute                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                              |  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------|--|
| PROAC approved recommendations for actions to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                              |  |
| Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Institution                                  |  |
| <ol> <li>Elaborate on clear links to program effectiveness.</li> <li>Identify measurement tools for learning outcomes.</li> <li>Use of data and how it is being communicated.</li> <li>Use required format.</li> <li>Complete submission (attachment of Form 1).</li> <li>Need for a program mission statement and inclusion of institutional mission statement.</li> <li>Provision of data and evidence for section VIII (program recommendations).</li> <li>Elaborate on connections between data and possible self-identified actions for department.</li> <li>Provision of financial statement (i.e. financial statement and federal grants).</li> <li>Provision of staffing analysis needs that include comparison with peer colleges and is data driven.</li> <li>Expansion of HR listing to include adjunct and professional services utilized.</li> <li>Include SLOs in courses taught.</li> </ol> | No recommendations to report for this cycle. |  |
|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                              |  |
| PROAC feedback back to                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                              |  |
| Program                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Institution                                  |  |
| No commentary.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | No commentary.                               |  |

# VI. Recommendations for Next Cycle

- 1. Program review processes should further be refined and simplified.
- 2. PROAC must ensure that all programs engage in meaningful program review, and help them understand and appreciate it as a process for continuous quality improvement.
- 3. Ensure that the results of program review are used to continually refine and improve program practices.

### VII. References

- 1. PROAC Appointment Memo
- 2. Student Learning Outcomes Comprehensive Implementation Program (SLOCIP)
- 3. NMC Assessment Taxonomy
- 4. PROAC Memo 1
- 5. PROAC Form 1: Five-Column Model
- 6. Form 2: Student Support and Administrative Units
- 7. Compliance Monitoring Matrix